



RESEARCH ARTICLE

EFFECTS OF POLITICAL INSTABILITY AND GOVERNANCE ON PLANNING AND IMPLEMENTATION OF FIVE YEAR PLANS IN PAKISTAN

***¹Dr. Mumtaz Khawaja, ²Uzma Panhwar and ²Dr. Abida Siddiqui**

¹Department of Education, Faculty of Education, University of Sindh

²Department of Educational Management and Supervision, Elsa Kazi Campus, University of Sindh Hyderabad Sindh

ARTICLE INFO

Article History:

Received 16th November, 2016
Received in revised form
18th December, 2016
Accepted 25th January, 2017
Published online 28th February, 2017

Key words:

Political Instability, Governance,
Planning, Implementation, Five year Plans.

ABSTRACT

The paper compares and examines the effects of socio political and socio economic condition of the country on Five year plans in Pakistan. The main objective of the study was to compare the various Five year plans to observe the effects of political instability and governance on framing and implementation process. The research is based on the Documentary analysis of the various Five year plans along with other government and nongovernment studies. The finding of the study reveals that the government determination and desire, political stability, international and domestic conditions affects the framing of the plans while; rapid turmoil of the government, political interference, social and economic conditions affects the planning as well implementation process. The study suggests that government should empowered the planning commission as an independent authority and give free hand to the planning commission with permanent qualified and trained staff without any interference.

Copyright©2017, Dr. Mumtaz Khawaja et al. This is an open access article distributed under the Creative Commons Attribution License, which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.

Citation: Dr. Mumtaz Khawaja, Uzma Panhwar and Dr. Abida Siddiqui, 2017. "Effects of political instability and governance on planning and implementation of five year plans in Pakistan", *International Journal of Current Research*, 09, (02), 46948-46952.

INTRODUCTION

Pakistan as an independence sovereign appeared on the map of the globe on 14th August 1947 with a poor economy. The government established an institution of the planning to make country strong and stable economically. A Development Board, an Economic Committee of the cabinet and Ministry of Economic Affairs were established in 1948 to coordinate, organize nation-building system and find out their priorities. Later on, a Six year Development Plan was formulated in 1949 for the period of July 1951 to June 1957 which was assembled in three months and included in Colombo plan in September 1950. In many ways this Plan was uncontrollable due to which it was modified and extended in the course of years. According to the Government of Pakistan (1957) and Manan (1970), scientifically the Six year plan was hardly a plan it was simply a collection of separate projects without any estimation and review of resources (national, human, physical and financial). Scientific planning was begun during the mid fifties with the framework of the First Five year Plan (1955-60) in Pakistan. These plans are also known as Mid-term plans. A planning Board was set up by the government in 1953 and was assigned the task of framing the plan for the most effective and balanced utilization of the country's resources, for the period of 1955 to

1960. After framing of the First plan, in 1958 the planning Board was given the status of planning commission and remaining all plans were framed by this commission.

- The First Five year Plan
- The Second Five year Plan
- The Third Five year Plan
- The Fourth Five year Plan
- The Fifth Five year Plan
- The Sixth Five year Plan
- The Seventh Five year Plan
- The Eighth Five year Plan
- The Ninth Five year Plan
- The Tenth Five year Plan
- The Medium Term Development Framework
- MTDF 2005-10
- The 10th Five year Plan 2010-15

Statement of the Problem

The Five year plans are framed for the future development of a country. In Pakistan more than ten Five year plans and Perspective Plans are framed to date, many developments have been seen but still it does not fulfill the requirement of the citizen. The study attempts to find out the reasons behind it. "It is assumed that political stability is regarded as vital to sustain peace, harmony, continuing constitutional contentment's, maintenance of government institutions and possession of community order" (Michael, 1971).

***Corresponding author: Dr. Mumtaz Khawaja,**
Department of Education, Faculty of Education, University of Sindh

Table 1. Plan Number and Periods

Plan No.	Period	Published in	Plan No.	Period	Published in
01	1955-60	1957	06	1983-88	NA
02	1960-65	1960	07	1988-93	1988
03	1965-70	1965	08	1993-98	
				(Not Documented)	----
04	1970-75	1970	09	2005-10	2005
05	1978-83	1978	10	2010-15	2010

Significance of the Study

The present study demonstrates the affects of political instability on the framing and implementing of the Five year plans in Pakistan and aware the government about the reasons behind it. Thus the article has the imperative role in this regard. This study will help to eliminate the prevailing shortcomings and planning mistakes in Pakistan as well suggest measure to overcome them. In this way the study will help to develop Five year plans on firm and solid basis in Pakistan.

Objectives of the Study

1. To study the number of government during various Five year plans of Pakistan since 1955 and its effects on planning and implementation;
2. To study the effects of political instability on the framing and implementation of the Five year plans;
3. To study the effects of socio-economic condition on framing and implementation of the plans.

Research Questions

1. How many governments were changed during different plan period?
2. What were the salient political and economical features during different plan period?
3. What were the effects of socio-political conditions on framing and implementation of the Five year plans?
4. What were the effects of economic condition on framing of the Five year plans?

Review of the Literature

Table 2. Chronological Review of Governance and Their Salient Features in Pakistan

Plan No. and Period	Governance		Salient Features
	Prime minister	Head	
01 (1955-60)	Mohammed Ali Bogra 17 th April 1953 - 11 th August 1955	Malik Ghulam Muhammad (Governor General) 19 th Oct 1951 - 5 th October 1955	The area of quantitative planning was launched in the country and in April 1954, the task of framing a Medium Term National Plan was given to the National Planning Board. But till May 1956 the draft of the plan could not see the light of the day due to political turmoil of five governments from 1955 to 1958, and the approval and sanction of the plan became late. The approval of the final draft was given in May 1958, when three years of the implementation of the Plan was already over. The plan was not implemented due to ignorance of economic policy and political instability. The President with the support of the army enforced Martial Law on 7 th October, 1958 and suspended the constitution of 1956. The government brought significant changes to make the planning commission more effective and valuable and changed the status of Planning Board into the planning commission in response to its commitment towards planning.
	Choudhry Mohammed Ali 11 th August 1955 - 12 th September 1956	Major General Iskandar Mirza 6 th October 1955 - 22 nd March 1956 as Governor General &	
	Hussain Shaheed Suhrawardy 12 th Sep 1956 - 18 th Oct 1957	23 rd March 1956 - 27 th October 1958 as president of Pakistan.	
	Ibrahim Ismail Chundrigar 18 th Oct 1957 - 16 th Dec 1957	General Muhammad Ayoob Khan 27 th Oct 1958 - 8 th June 1962 (Martial-Law Administrator),	
	Malik Feroze Khan Noon Dec 16 1957 - 7 th Oct 1958		
	General Muhammad Ayoob Khan 24 th Oct 1958 - 27 th October 1958		

Continue.....

MATERIALS AND METHODS

Research Design

The present study was qualitative in nature where the document analysis was used as a technique. The Various Five year plans of Pakistan were studied very thoroughly along with other government documents. Journal, research studies and reports related to the study. According to Bailey (1994), "The documentary method is used to analysis the documents that include information concerning the occurrence we expect to study". Payne and Payne (2004) express the documentary method as the techniques used to sort, examine, interpret and recognize the limits of physical.

RESULTS

1. Almost three decades of the history in Pakistan was ruled by the Military government (5 Marshal Law Administrators were imposed), while the remaining period is consisted weak democracy in the country.
2. Most of the political government could not completed their period except the period of Pakistan People's Party (2008-2013) while, present government has spend more than three years in the Parliament.
3. When there is consistency of government during planning and implementation period, Plans were published in time as well as most of the targets set were also achieved.
4. Political instability makes negative impact on framing and implementation of the Five year plans.
5. During rapid change of government, most of the plans neither published in time nor implemented according to the programmes given.
6. During non-implementation / absence of the economic plans the planning run on adhoc-basis (annual plans).
7. Most of the plans were framed before the time, due to which already running plans could not completed their period.

02 (1960-65)	General Muhammad Ayoob Khan	General Muhammad Ayoob Khan 27 th Oct 1958 - 8 th June 1962 (Martial-Law Administrator), From 8 th June 1962 - 25 th March 1969 (President of Pakistan)	The Second Five year plan (1960-65) laid its emphasis on the areas which were not fully supported or ignored in the First Five year Plan and was largely a continuation of the first plan. Specific agriculture and industrial sub-sectors were given priorities. Investment in technical and vocational education, and provision of housing also positive aspects in this plan. During the period those private entrepreneurs were encouraged to participate in which huge income could be made. During this period internal peace and stability of the government was observed and the planning process received unstinted support of the Government, which greatly contributed to its success. No doubt that Pakistan came to be looked upon as a model of planned development. After the war of 1965 with India more resources than been planned also was diverted to defense. Foreign assistance was declined and domestic savings were needed to be increased. Political and economic grumble moved protest activities declined the power of the government and enforced Ayoob Khan's resignation in March 1969. The Commander-in-Chief of the Army, General Agha Mohammed Yahya Khan became President and Chief Martial Law. The plan was launched during great uncertainties. The political conditions declined after the elections and the Fourth Plan could not be implemented from the very beginning and became absolutely irrelevant under the dramatically distorted political geography. The Plan was thus buried in the debris of the United Pakistan. The era 1972- 77 was marked by 'ad hoc planning' with chief dependence on annual plans. The planning commission was immobilized. The era of 'ad hoc planning' was finished in July 1977 and the new government immediately reverted back to medium-term planning.
03 (1965-70)	General Muhammad Ayoob Khan, from 8 th June 1962 - 25 th March 1969 (President of Pakistan). General Agha Yahya Khan 25 th March 1969 - 20 th Dec 1971.	General Muhammad Ayoob Khan, 27 th October 1958 - 25 th March 1969 President of Pakistan. General Agha Yahya Khan 25 th March 1969-20 th Dec 1971.	
04 (1965-70)	Noor-ul-Amin 7 th Dec 1970 - 16 th December 1971.	Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto 20 th Dec 1971 - 13 th Aug 1973 (Chief Martial-law Administrator and President of Pakistan)	
04 (1965-70)	Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto 14 th Aug 1973 - 5 th July 1977	Choudhry Fazal Ellahi 14 th Aug 1973 - 16 th Sept 1978 General Muhammad Zia-ul-Haque Martial-law administrator 5 th July 1977 - 17 th August 1988	
05 (1978-83)	General Muhammad Zia-ul-Haque Martial-law administrator as well as the President from 5 th July 1977 - 30 th December 1985	General Muhammad Zia-ul-Haque Martial-law administrator as well as President from 5 th July 1977 - 30 th December 1985.	To improve the economy and raise the standard of poorest in the country the Fifth Five year plan was an effort by the government of the time. There was an increase in the defense expenses, and flow of refugees to Pakistan from Afghanistan after the Soviet union incursion in December 1979, as well as increase in international oil prices, drew resources away from planned investments. Even so, some of the plan's targets were accomplished. A considerable move towards the private sector was the attribute of Sixth Five year plan (1983-88).
06 (1983-88)	Mohammad Khan Junejo 23 rd March 1985 to 29 th May 1988.	General Muhammad Zia-ul-Haque Martial-law administrator till 30 th December 1985 as well as president of Pakistan 17 th August 1988.	It was considered to begin some of the major problems of the economy; low investment and savings ratios; low productivity in agriculture; heavy dependence on imported energy; and low expenses on health and education. The plan achieved the targeted economy and went above the target, but the rigorous drought in 1986 and 1987 twisted into a rolling plan during the last two years of its life. The plan was regarded only as a partial success.
07 (1988-93)	Benazir Bhutto 2 nd December 1988 - 6 th August 1990. Ghulam Mustafa Jatoi (Care-taker) 6 th August 1990 - 6 th Nov 1990. Mian Muhammad Nawaz Sharief 6 th November 1990 - 18 th April 1993. Mr. Balkh Sher Mazari (Care-taker) 18 th April 1993 to 26 th May 1993.	Ghulam Ishaq Khan 17 th August 1988 - December 13 1988 (as Acting President) Ghulam Ishaq Khan 13 December 1988 - 18 th July 1993 (as elected President).	The Seventh plan (1988-93) was framed under the guidelines of one of the three consequent series of the Medium Frame Work of the second perspective plan of Pakistan and begun along the long term vision of the society and determined to effort for the comprehension of the wide socioeconomic conditions. The plan provided much greater importance to the private investment in all the fields of the economy than ever before.

Continue.....

	Moin Qureshi (Care-taker) 18 th July 1993 to 19 th October 1993. Banazir Bhutto 19 th October 1993 - 5 th November 1996		The Eighth Five year Plan (1993-98) was launched at a critical stage. Due to rapid turmoil of the government the plan was launched in 1994 instead of 1993. Attention was paid on short-range issues and the annual plans were being carried out to run the Economic policy.
08 (1993-1998)	Malik Meraj Khalid (Care-taker) 5 th November 1996 to 17 th February 1997 Muhammad Nawaz Shrief 17 th February 1997 - 12 th October 1998.	Sardar Farooq Ahmad Laghari 14 th November, 1993 - 2 nd December, 1997.	The role of government was documented as the catalyst in the Eighth Five year plan (1993-98) and manager instead of the main vehicle of economic growth. The overall importance was put on to raise the individual scheme and private venture.
		JUSTICE (R) M. Rafique Tarar 1 st January 1998 - 21 st June 2001.	
09 (1998-2003)	Zafarullah Jamali, 21 st November 2002 – 26 th June 2004	Justice (R) M. Rafique Tarar 1 st January 1998 - 21 st June 2001	Due to changing socioeconomic and global scenario and the turmoil of the government by the military rigime in the country in 1998 the 9 th Five year plan could not be launched in the country The document of the 9th Five year Plan was not launched until the year 2000. From June 2004, the Planning Commission gave a new name to the Five year Plan as Medium Term Development Framework (MTDF).
		General Pervaiz Mushrraf as Chief Executive from 12 th October 1998 - 2002 & president of Pakistan from 2002 - 18 th August 2008.	
2005- 2010 (Known as Medium Term Development Framework MTDF)	Mr. Shoukat Aziz as Prime Minister August, 2004 November, 2007. Mr. Choudhry Shujaat (Care-taker) November, 2007 – Feb 2008. Mr. Yousif Raza Gillani 25 th March 2008 – 19 th June 2012	General Pervaiz Mushrraf as Chief Executive from 12 th October 1998 - 2002 & president of Pakistan from 2002- 2008.	The MTDF 2005-2010 was framed by thirty two working group and was based on to improve physical infrastructure for speed up production growth. The fields where support of the private sectors could be found were recognized. For the appropriate achievement of millennium development goals, social sector policies were identified.
	Mr. Yousif Raza Gillani 25 th March 2008 – 19 th June 2012. Mr. Raja Ashraf 22 nd June 2012 – 25 th March 2013.	Mr. Asif Ali Zardari as President of Pakistan from September 2008 – 2013.	Change of the government and new election again affected the implementation of the plan.
10 2010- 2015	Mir Hazar Khan Khoso (care taker) 25 th March 2013 – 4 th June 2013. Mr. Mian Nawaz Sharief, 5 th June, 2013 – continued.	Mr. Asif Ali Zardari as President of Pakistan from September, 2008–2013 Mr. Mumnoon Hussain 2013 - continued	The Tenth Five year Plan was given the name of Investing in People and changed the past practices of growth and development for which solid reasons were given, This Plan was framed and issued when Pakistan was facing the economic, security and development crises.

DISCUSSION

The review and findings describes the whole history of planning process in Pakistan. The responsibility of framing the policy and planning in all fields of development is mostly carried out by the Planning Commission (PC) since its establishment. The table also reveals background features and the number of governments during the planning and implementation period, along with the salient features of the time. It reveals that about five prime ministers and four heads of the government were changed during the 1st plan period (1955-60), due to which the approval and sanction of the plan was delayed. These cause not only the late issue of the plan but also could not fully implement and could not achieve the targets. The same was the case with eighth and the ninth Five year plan where due to turmoil of the government plan were published late or totally not documented as a plan (Ninth Five year plan). More than half of the time in the history, Pakistan has remained under the military regime and appeared as a feeble and unstable democratic country in the region. The reason behind is politically, wherever the religious fundamentalism, sectarianism, cultural and regional economic discrepancies has played their role and has made country unstable and weak (Ishrat The government stability also effect on planning and implementation of the plan; if the government is stable during the planning and implementation period, the achievement of the target remained positive, and in condition of instability the implementation remained unsuccessful. As in the First plan, the number of government changes was very

high in the life of planning; the plan was not only published late, but also not implemented completely till the last hour of the plan period. While; the second and third plan due to the stability of the government not only achieved its targets, but also many other countries copied it, made their own plans on the same line and today they are more developed countries. Discussing the factors affects on economic growth of a country Dr. Usmani describe that the policies, programmes and projects which were started by one government were almost rescind the policies, put backs or abandons by every new government in Pakistan without any solid explanation. Due to this reason private investors relapsed from committing their capital in the country. While other developed countries like China where most of the ongoing projects are continued after small modification (Bailey, 1994). In the history of Pakistan almost all Five-year plans were shelved after the change of the regime either it is prepared during political or military period and none of them were remained successful in getting the desired outcomes (Mehtab Haider, 2011). In 1971 due to separation of one wing of Pakistan the planning done in 1970 was become insubstantial and converted into annual basis and no new plan was framed till 1978. The same was revised in the 8th and 9th plan, where the Eighth plan was framed late (in 1994 instead of 1993) due to dismissal of government in 1993 and also not fully implemented, while the document of the Ninth plan could not see the sun due to the turmoil of the government and international situations in 1998. Findings from the study conducted by Azra Shakoor (2011) describe that the Political unstable circumstances were the main reasons due to

that plans and educational policies failed. It is happened that Five year plans and educational policies introduced without considering the economic crisis of the country as after war of 1965 and 1971, there were serious financial crisis in the country (Michael, 1971). Due to political instability along with many internal and external problems Pakistan is facing issue of terrorism also. Political stability is very important in present times as it is facing external as well internal terrorism. The instability of the system and unaccountability of the public servant to the masses has created and raised the practice of corruption as an accepted tradition Political Instability. The corruption in Pakistan is created and raised due to the instability of the government and the absence of the accountability of the government employs to the masses A case of Pakistan (Memon).

Conclusion

The article tries to understand the effects of political instability and governance on planning and implementation of Five year plans in Pakistan. In doing so, it reviewed the different Five year plans of Pakistan, the conditions at the time of their planning and implementation literature that diagnoses the reasons for outcome of plans in Pakistan. Impact of type of regimes and the political instability as the factors are considered responsible for the failures, for example: clarity of planning goals, change of government during planning and implementation period, political obligation of leadership, governance organization, change of priorities of the different government, starting of new programmes before the completion of the running, centralisation, resource constraints, and authority of donors. In addition, it is realised that planning process is a national process and often faces the problem of local implementation.

Recommendations of the Study

The study recommends that

- All the political parties, military command and opposition should be involved in the planning process.
- Strong political commitment and collaboration should be insured for proper planning and implementation of the Five year plans and for the stability and strength of the country.
- The Government should empowered the planning commission as an independent authority and give free hand to the planning commission with permanent qualified and trained staff without any interference.
- The Government should be bounded to continue the plans, projects, and programme started by one government and should not be stopped.

Acknowledgement

The paper is a part of my Research Thesis work submitted for the award of PhD degree in Education with title comparative

study of various Five year Plans of Pakistan 1955-60 to date in the sector of Education and Training.

REFERENCES

- Azra Shakoor & et al. 2011. 1947-2008 Evaluation of Elementary Education in Pakistan International Journal of Humanities and Social Science Vol. 1 No. 15 [Special Issue – October 2011] 270
- Bailey, K. 1994. *Methods of Social Research*. Fourth Edition, New York: The Free Press.
- Government of Pakistan, 2010. *Medium-Term Development Framework*, Planning Commission, Government of Pakistan, Islamabad.
- Government of Pakistan. 2000. *Evaluation of Eighth Five year Plan (1993-98)*. Planning Commission, Islamabad.
- Govt. of Pakistan, 1965. *The Third Five Year Plan (1965-70)*, Planning Commission, Islamabad.
- Govt. of Pakistan. 1957. *The First Five Year Plan (1955-60)*. Planning Board, Karachi.
- Govt. of Pakistan. 1960. *The Second Five Year Plan (1960-65)*. Planning Commission, Islamabad.
- Govt. of Pakistan. 1970. *The Fourth Five Year Plan (1970-75)*. Planning Commission, Islamabad.
- Govt. of Pakistan. 1978. *The Fifth Five Year Plan (1978-83)*, Planning Commission, Islamabad.
- Govt. of Pakistan. 1983. *The Sixth Five Year Plan (1983-88)*. Planning Commission, Islamabad.
- Govt. of Pakistan. 1988. *The Seventh Five Year Plan (1988-93)*. Planning Commission, Islamabad.
- Govt. of Pakistan. 1993. *The Eighth Five Year Plan (1993-98)*. Planning Commission, Islamabad.
- Ishrat Husain. 2010. *The Role of Politics in Pakistan's Economy*. Journal of International Affairs, Vol. 63, No. 1, Pakistan & Afghanistan: Domestic Pressures and Regional Threats (FALL/WINTER 2009), pp. 1-18 retrieved from www.jstor.org/stable/24384169
- Mehtab Haider 2011. All Five-year plans of Pakistan were Failures. The Times International Sunday, January 30, 2011 retrieved from <http://www.pc.gov.pk/>
- Memon, A.S. & et al. *Political Instability – A Case of Pakistan*. *Journal of Political Studies*, Vol. 18, Issue-1, 31-43.
- Michael, Stein, 1971. *Federal Political System in Federal societies*. In Peter Meckison Canadian Federation (Toronto) pp.119-120.
- Parvez Hasan. *Failed Economic Promise: Lessons from Pakistan's Development Experience* lahore school of economics, December 11, 2013 retrieved from <http://lahoreschoolofeconomics.blogspot.com/2013/12/failed-economic-promise-lessons-from.html>) 2016
- Payne, G. and Payne, J. 2004. *Key Concepts in Social Research*. London: Sage Publications.
- Usmani, M. 2015. *Political Stability and Economic Growth*. Jahanior's World Times, Monthly Journal. Retrieved from <http://jworldtimes.com/on 15.12.2016>.
